DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 081 527 56 RC 007 234

AUTHOR Payne, I. V.
TITLE Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program. Program Accomplishment Audit, 1972-73.
INSTITUTION Artesia Public Schools, N. Mex.
SPONS AGENCY Bureau of Elementary and Secondary Education (DHEW/OE), Washington, D.C. Div. of Bilingual Education.
PUB DATE 5 Jul 73
GRANT OEG-0-9-410028-3443(280)
NOTE 17p.

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.65 HC-$3.29
DESCRIPTORS *Bilingual Education; *Comparative Analysis; Educational Improvement; *Evaluation Criteria; Program Effectiveness; *Program Evaluation; Quality Control; *Spanish Speaking; Teacher Aides
IDENTIFIERS Artesia; *Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program

ABSTRACT

The purpose of the audit report on the Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program (1972-73) of the Artesia School District is to give a critique of the project's evaluation with notations on comparative findings of the project evaluation and the audit, and to confirm or question the program modifications proposed in the evaluation. The 5 audit report sections are: (1) introductory and general comments on the project evaluation quality and comparative findings of the project evaluation and the audit; (2) detailed critique of the comprehensive evaluation for each component, based on an assessment of the instruments used, data collection, and data analysis techniques, and presentation; (3) description of the auditor's on-site findings and correlation with the evaluator's data and reports on a component by component basis, and a summary of consistencies and discrepancies; (4) general recommendations for evaluation design revisions with a rationale for each; and (5) confirmation or questioning of the need for program modifications proposed in the project evaluation. (NQ)

ED 081527

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

PROGRAM ACCOMPLISHMENT AUDIT
1972-73

SOUTHEASTERN NEW MEXICO BILINGUAL PROGRAM

Sponsored by:

Title VII, ESEA Bilingual Education Project
U. S. Office of Education

Under contract with:

Artesia Municipal Schools
Artesia, New Mexico
Grant Number OEG-0-9-410028-3443-(280)

Prepared by:

T. V. Payne
Program Auditor
Box 2224
Portales, New Mex. 88130

R-007234

FILMED FROM BEST AVAILABLE COPY

EDUCATIONAL ACCOMPLISHMENT AUDIT REPORT

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
INTRODUCTION	1
Scope of the Audit Report	1
SECTION I - INTRODUCTORY AND GENERAL COMMENTS	2
SECTION II - CRITIQUE OF EVALUATION REPORT	5
The Evaluation Design	5
The Evaluation Instruments	5
Control groups	5
Audit of Performance Objectives Accomplishments	6
Standard curriculum performance	6
Instructional and English language component	6
Spanish language component	7
Self-image component	7
English-Spanish teaching component	8
SECTION III - AUDITOR'S ON-SITE VISITATION	8
Administration of the Program	9
Teacher-aide training program	9
Teacher use of teacher-aides	10
The evaluation	11
Conclusion	11
SECTION IV - REVISION IN EVALUATION DESIGN	12
SECTION V - NEEDS FOR PROGRAM MODIFICATION	12
CONCLUSIONS	13

EDUCATIONAL ACCOMPLISHMENT AUDIT REPORT

In compliance with the contractual agreement, legal prescriptions, and official directions under the provisions of Title VII of Public Law 89-10, as amended, for the establishment of bilingual education programs the following educational accomplishment audit report is being submitted on the Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program (OEG-0-9-410028-3443-(280). The program is funded through the Artesia (New Mexico) School District with Bill Gutierrez as Project Director.

The audit report as submitted herein, is a critique concerning the project evaluation with notations on comparative findings of the project evaluation and the audit is related to the performance and process objectives established in the evaluation design instrument. The auditor, in this report, will confirm, question, or suggest the need for program modifications which have been proposed as a result of the project evaluation and onsite visitations and observations.

Scope of the Audit Report

The audit report follows rather closely the Suggested Audit Report Content Areas received from the United States Office of Education and made a part of the contractual agreement between the Educational Accomplishment Auditor and the Project Director, as follows:

1. Introductory and general comments concerning the quality of the project evaluation and the comparative findings of the project evaluation and the audit.
2. Detailed critique of the comprehensive evaluation conducted, by component, based on an assessment of the instruments inside, data collection. data analysis, and the manner in which data analysis is presented.
3. Description of the audit contractor's onsite visit findings and their correlation with the project evaluator's data and reports on a component by component basis; summary of consistencies and discrepancies, and

interpretation of the discrepancies.

4. Recommendations for revisions in the evaluation design, including a rationale for each recommendation. Since the auditor's objectivity can be maintained only if the selection of a specific corrective action is a local decision, the audit contractor will provide general rather than specific recommendations, posing several alternative actions on possible sources of assistance to the project director in correcting the deficiency.

5. Confirmation or questioning of the need for program modifications which have been proposed as a result of project evaluation.

Each of the audit areas described above will be referred to as sections with section number agreeing with the audit description number.

SECTION I - INTRODUCTORY AND GENERAL COMMENTS

The Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program, OEG-0-9-410028-3443-(280), is sponsored by the Artesia (New Mexico) Public Schools and is under the direction of a Project Director who along with other available specialists from within the project and/or school system provides managerial and supervisory leadership.

Six public school districts (Artesia, Carlsbad, Dexter, Hagerman, Lake Arthur, and Roswell) with supplementary and complementary help from Eastern New Mexico University-Roswell Campus and the New Mexico State Department of Education have cooperated to implement, and continue, the Bilingual Program in the Lower Pecos Valley of New Mexico. The cooperating schools are participating in the planned program on a daily basis for a period of nine (9) months. Artesia is in the fourth year phase of the project while the other schools are involved in their third year.

All classes participating in the project are housed in regular classrooms within the confines of an elementary school plant. Each classroom component operates within the regular hours of the respective elementary school. School policy relating to personnel, students, and general building management and operation extends to all personnel and

students in the bilingual and laboratory components. In all components where a monolingual laboratory teacher is involved, bilingual sessions are provided within the morning schedule since the teacher aide assigned to each classroom being serviced works in the classroom only in the morning. The paraprofessionals in the project attend the college program during afternoons and evenings.

The effectiveness of an evaluation is primarily determined by how well the evaluating techniques quantify through objective measurement and/or through individualized student needs assessment, the quality and extent of pupil behavioral development for which the project is chiefly responsible. After careful examination of the evaluation design, techniques employed in the evaluation, procedures follow, and purusal of the written evaluation report it can be concluded that the major objectives have been to measure learning outcomes, progress toward accomplishment of program objectives, and a realistic assessment of individual accomplishments and needs. The evaluation, although cognizant of the inputs, has concentrated its evaluative judgments on outputs - progress toward achievement of stated project objectives.

Standardized instruments, uniformly applied to experimental (project participants) groups and control groups have been utilized for objective measurements. The instrument used for cognitive evaluation of general academic accomplishment for grades three and four was the Comprehensive Tests of Basic Skills published by California Test Bureau. The C.T.B.S. was selected because it follows the statewide pattern of student assessment and enjoys generally high acceptance as a standardized measuring device with high validity in normal applications. Analysis of test results have been divided into four groups:

1. Dominant Spanish speaking children in bilingual components.
2. Non-Dominant Spanish speaking children in the bilingual component.

3. Dominant Spanish speaking children in the laboratory component.
4. Non-Dominant Spanish speaking children in the laboratory component.

Criterion Reference Skills Charts were maintained by teachers in grades one and two. These charts were developed for each child and covered areas of reading, mathematics, social studies, science, English as a second language, Spanish as a second language, and multicultural development. Analysis of these individual records has established the areas of accomplishment and identify areas of student need. Validity of the Skill Charts is dependent upon the professional judgment of the teacher as she examines the accomplishments of each individual student in each skill activity in the various Skill Charts.

Informal assessments based on observations, teacher made measuring instruments and student performance were utilized to provide feedback during the teaching-learning process as supplementary instruments (or processes) for project evaluation purposes.

The evaluation design, procedures, and techniques were developed and refined during and following a series of conferences between the project director, the evaluator, and the auditors. Communication channels have remained open and have served to retain excellent rapport. Through the dedicated and cooperative efforts of all concerned it has been possible to eliminate irrelevant procedures and the refinement of evaluation procedures to better assess the level, or degree, of accomplishment of program objectives and at the same time providing for identification of specific needs of individuals.

It is unfortunate that the project has found it necessary to contract with a different evaluator for each year it has been in operation. Circumstances have made this unavoidable, and in fact, in some ways perhaps there has been some benefits in this, in that the evaluation to date reflect the analyses and interpretation of four separate but

qualified persons. The current evaluator has approached the evaluation process in a serious manner, has brought a wealth of professional insight into the evaluation, and has functioned with a high level of professionalism. Her report reflects all of these qualities.

SECTION II - CRITIQUE OF EVALUATION REPORT

The Evaluation Design

The Evaluation Design was developed to measure the extent to which performance objectives were attained. The design is well organized and meets the basic needs for effective program evaluation.

The Evaluation Instruments

The evaluation instruments consist of the following:

1. The California Test of Basic Skills was designated as the basic instrument to measure the instructional and English language arts components. It was selected largely because it is part of the state testing program. It is a well recognized test and has high validity.
2. The Self-Image Test, a project devised test that is highly subjective, does function to give some indications of the student's self-image.
3. The Spanish Language Arts Criterion Reference Test, developed and used locally for the first time, appears adequate to determine baseline data and achievement related specifically to the program content and objectives.
4. The Otis-Lennon Mental Ability Test was given city-wide to first-grade students in the fall, and was therefore a useful instrument to assess the readiness and intellectual level of first graders in the bilingual program.
5. The Metropolitan Achievement Test was given to all city students in the second grade. The scores from this test were used to help determine the maturity and ability levels of the second grade children.

Control Groups. The Control Group was maintained for third and fourth grades because of high mobility, some problems were encountered in retaining a matched grouping large enough to yield significant comparative data. Through a system of "rematching" other students were included in the control group.

Audit of Performance Objectives
Accomplishments

Standard curriculum performance. In examination of the evaluation report and inspection of test records and data it is possible to ascertain that the project objective relative to growth in standard curriculum (reading, arithmetic and language) for grades three and four dominant Spanish speaking have been properly analyzed by the project evaluator. The results show that the fourth grade bilingual group far exceeded the control group in reading and language. The accomplishment in arithmetic, although near average for each group, shows very little difference in amount of per pupil gain.

For the third grade, the bilingual group showed marked gain over the control group in all three areas. The assessment as made by the evaluator is accurate, and it can be concluded that the objective was not only met but actual growth far exceeds the stated objective.

The non-Spanish dominant language third and fourth graders present an interesting picture on standard curriculum performance. The fourth grade bilingual group outperformed the control group in all areas (reading, arithmetic, and language) to a degree well above that stated in the objective. However, at the third grade level the control group demonstrated performance on all three tests significantly above that of the bilingual group.

The evaluator's assessment that the fourth grade surpassed the project objective while the third grade failed to reach the objective is an accurate assessment.

The data for first and second grades was analyzed and the statistical treatment indicates that positive gains were made by students in the standard curriculum.

Instructional and English language component. In response to an informal questionnaire teacher assessment of student performance shows that teachers generally felt that students were achieving at least five percent (5%) more of

the standard curriculum. Response to items on the questionnaire ranged from small gain assessment to large gain, with teachers generally feeling that children in the bilingual program were making positive performance development. The evaluators interpretation of teacher assessment is accurate. From the results of the questionnaire it can be concluded that, in the opinion of teachers in the program, bilingual instruction is no hindrance to the achievement in the English language component.

Spanish language component. In analysis of the objective relative to facility in use of Spanish language the following assessment summary is made by the evaluator:

> Grade four, dominant Spanish and non-dominant Spanish speaking bilingual groups both exceeded the performance of the corresponding control groups well above the level projected in the stated objective.
>
> Grade three, dominant Spanish and non-dominant Spanish speaking bilingual groups both exceeded the performance of the corresponding control groups well above the level projected in the stated objective.
>
> In grade two the non-dominant Spanish speaking bilingual group failed to attain the seventy percent (70%) level on the Spanish Language Arts Criterion Reference Test by a slight 1.4 points. The first grade and second grade dominant Spanish speaking group and the first grade non-dominant Spanish speaking groups attained or exceeded the seventy percent (70%) criterion established by the objective.

Examination of tests and test results by the project auditor confirms this assessment.

Self-image component. The evaluators analysis and assessment of the objective that bilingual program students will have a five percent (5%) better self-image than control students indicates that grades two and four significantly exceeded the objective while grades one and two were slightly below the projected greater growth in self-image. The evaluator's notation that while the self-image score results for bilingual program children was positive at all grade levels, while losses were registered for third and fourth grade control groups suggests that the bilingual program is

effective in helping these children hold a relatively good self-image. The auditors acknowledge this observation as significant.

When teachers were asked to respond to the part of the questionnaire related to the students' self-image, their responses support the analyses of the self-image rating scale responses by students.

English-Spanish teaching component. The process objective that "all children will be taught by bilingual teachers utilizing both English and Spanish for teaching purposes on a fifty percent (50%) classroom time basis" was analyzed by the evaluator as summarized in the following manner: (a) it was not possible to verify whether equal classroom instructional time was equally divided between English and Spanish, (b) teachers and aides generally felt that their students did receive adequate preparation to operate bilingually, (c) observation led to the conclusion that a disparity did exist among classrooms in the use of Spanish in the instructional component, and (d) although aides were being given teaching responsibility, to expect twelve and one-half hours per week of instruction utilizing Spanish requires aides to teach constantly in Spanish since they are in the classroom on a part-time basis.

SECTION III - AUDITOR'S ON-SITE VISITATION

During the course of the 1972-73 school year the auditing team spent a total of fourteen man-days in on-site visitation. Interim reports were submitted earlier. The following is a report of visitations near the end of the teaching year.

The specific purposes of the on-site visitation were (a) to assess the role and input of Artesia Public School Administration in the Title VII Program, (b) to determine whether the teacher aide training program objectives were being met, (c) to observe whether teachers were making

effective use of their aides, and (d) to study raw data and other pertinent information related to the evaluation of the program.

Administration of the Program

The project director and curriculum specialist work effectively and have given a realistic and educationally sound meaning, understood by all participants, to the philosophy and function of bilingual education and to the content of the curriculum.

On-site visits have served to establish that the principals are cooperative and understand the programs operation. The project director is consulted by principals in matters relating to personnel, parental involvement, and pupil participation involved in all facets of the project. It has been established that teachers and aides are enthusiastic about bilingual program activities and are well informed regarding the curriculum. The school community has come to endorse, accept, and understand the bilingual program as it is currently being administered by the Artesia Public Schools. Upward expansion of the program is following a "continued growth" pattern.

The personnel continue to demonstrate a willingness to work in modifying and adapting the curriculum content to meet the individual educational needs of children in the various classroom units of the project.

School administrators (superintendent, principals, curriculum coordinator, etc.) have cooperated in developing working relationships with all those assigned to the bilingual program as a means of enhancing an effective educational experience for children.

Teacher-aide training program. The Grant Package Proposal for FY 1972-73 included an ambitious, but realistic, program for the para-professional training component of the project. The agreement was continued with Eastern New Mexico University-Roswell Campus to continue the training of the para-professionals. At the present time ENMU-Roswell

Campus offers para-professionals a program of studies which enable the participants to eventually acquire a Bachelor of Arts degree in elementary education with a major in the teaching of ethnic groups and a minor in Spanish. Some thirty participants are taking advantage of this opportunity. Cultural Anthropology, Ethnology of the Southwest, Selected Topics in Spanish (a beginning field course in Bilingual Instruction), Hispanic Culture and Civilization, and all levels of Spanish courses are but a few of the prescribed offerings. It is the feeling of the auditing team that the pre-service and in-service training programs as implemented have provided the participants with a vast and useful body of knowledge regarding modern theories of human growth and development and a realistic philosophy of education. We agree with the Project Director when he states that "the teacher-aide training component of the project has offered stability and scope toward the gradual training of bilingual teachers to fill the vast need of Southeastern New Mexico." Another significant strength of the prescribed training component (pre-service and in-service) is that although methods for implementation of the curriculum are a basic part of the agenda, it is child-oriented when one studies the content and guidelines offered to the participants. Parents, teachers, teacher-aides and pupils are involved in the planning. The input provided in this manner is valued by both the Project Director and the Curriculum Specialist. Incidentally, the latter two professionals go about their business with dedication and not with assumed superiority as two "generals" of a militaristic extravaganza. Their sincere dedication serves as a model for other participants in the program.

Teacher use of teacher-aides. This component of the program has had more emphasis during FY 1972-73. It is a major component of any effective bilingual-bicultural program. The teacher-aide is functioning as a second voice for the teacher by assisting with the Spanish instructional

reinforcement; the implications of importance are obvious.

At several of the centers visited teachers were more willing to allow the teacher-aide to assume the instruction of the related curriculum in Spanish. It has been noted that all participating teachers were regarding their aides as part of the teaching team and that planning for the day's activities is indeed a cooperative enterprise involving both. Significant improvements were noticed in follow-up visits.

The evaluation. Cooperative efforts and sincere interest in the program by those associated with the program made it possible to meet all obstacles with satisfactory alternative solutions. The evaluation report as submitted has been thoroughly critiqued elsewhere. Suffice it here to merely comment that the evaluation was done in a very professional manner and presented with as much objectivity as was possible. There was no evidence of any attempt to whitewash any phase of the program. On several occasions explanations and such conclusions were arrived at only after very thoughtful consideration.

Conclusion. The auditing experience, particularly the on-site visitation, has been a most pleasant one. The courtesies extended by all of the Bilingual Program staff and school administrators are indeed appreciated and most gratifying. The auditing team sincerely submits that the Southeastern Bilingual Program might well serve as a model for this region, as for four years it has dated to be creative, innovative, flexible, and unafraid of publishing the factual results of its effort using as a base its belief that "this program is a vehicle and pedigogical tool to better prepare children to function as successful citizens in a democratic society." It is firmly believed that this program is bringing to Artesia and environs interracial unity and understanding.

SECTION IV - REVISION IN EVALUATION DESIGN

The Evaluation Design as utilized during the 1972-73 school year has proved to be effective and stimulator for more effective instruction. It is the auditor's recommendation that the 1972-73 Evaluation Design instrument be utilized for 1973-74 with the following possible modification:

1. Consideration should be given to either revising the self-image test or the acquisition of another instrument for this purpose. Reference was made to this in the auditor's interim report and the evaluator's final evaluation report.
2. A plan for pre-testing on the criterion referenced tests should be developed and implemented at the beginning of the 1973-74 school year.
3. The criterion cards used for maintaining individual student progress records should be periodically reviewed by the project director and the evaluator throughout the school year.

SECTION V - NEEDS FOR PROGRAM MODIFICATION

The Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program has just completed its fourth successful year of operation. The program in the Artesia Public Schools has advanced through the four year (grade) level of school.

The successes and weaknesses of the project have been identified through visitations, observations, informal assessments, and the formal evaluation of the project.

On the basis of these opportunities for assessing the program the auditors present the following suggestions:

1. Establish more clearly the differentiation between the bilingual classrooms and the laboratory classrooms in order that the strengths and weaknesses of each might be more clearly identified. This is also suggested as a means of helping school personnel not identified with the program and interested townspeople better understand the program.
2. Establish some framework for analysis of cost-quality relationships of both the bilingual and the laboratory components. These should be developed in such manner that the dollar value of services received can be compared with the pupil cost in the "regular" classroom.

3. Earlier assessments have shown that students' self-image suffers significantly at the intermediate grade levels. Serious consideration for extending the bilingual program into the fifth year (grade) with special emphasis being placed on the affective behavioral domain should be a priority item for the Artesia Public Schools.

4. Elementary building principals need to become more actively involved. Ultimately the program will become their responsibility as part of the elementary school program. Every effort should be made to involve them in all inservice activities. Likewise, principlas should actively engage in future project planning.

5. Efforts should continue to encourage teachers to plan for, and utilize, teacher aide services more extensively as bilingual adjuncts in the classroom.

6. Time utilization is important in order that both teacher and aide function at peak efficiency. Careful planning should become a part of role expectations for all personnel in the program in order that the best possible utilization of available time and professional talents will be assured.

CONCLUSIONS

The Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program has successfully completed its fourth year of operation. During this time the program has expanded upward and into other cooperating school districts.

Although staffing primary grades with well qualified bilingual teachers is becoming increasingly difficult, the Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program has successfully met this obstacle and the program has moved forward with no significant interruptions.

Mr. Bill Gutierrez, Project Director, has worked unceasingly toward the accomplishment of project goals. He has exerted positive leadership in involving staff members in planning and program development. Mr. Gutierrez enjoys high respect from his staff, the administration, and the downtown community.

The staff has proven itself to be dedicated and anxious to develop the best possible bilingual program to serve the youth throughout the Lower Pecos Valley. The

members of the staff have supported such project activities as inservice training, program development, community involvement, and materials development.

Although project evaluation presented some problems at times, it has been successfully completed and presented in a report that is readily understood. The report is accurate, frank, and to the point. Some areas failed to measure as strongly in the evaluation process as aimed for in the objective. Yet, generally speaking the project has demonstrated success.

The project auditors have been well received by project staff members and administrators of all schools cooperating in the project. Records, reports, and materials were always available when needed.

The Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Project and its staff are to be commended for providing a forward thrust program which is contributing to the educational breakthrough for effective education for the dominant Spanish speaking child in the southwest.

Respectfully submitted:

I. V. Payne, Chief Auditor

Edward Medina, Auditor
July 5, 1973